

ELE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

Metropolitan Historic Zoning Commission Sunnyside in Sevier Park 3000 Granny White Pike Nashville, Tennessee 37204 Telephone: (615) 862-7970

STAFF RECOMMENDATION 1051 Petway Avenue March 17, 2021

Application: New Construction—Addition **District:** Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay **Council District:** 06 Base Zoning: RS7.5 Map and Parcel Number: 08301025000 **Applicant:** Paul Boulifard Project Lead: Melissa Baldock, melissa.baldock@nashville.gov

De ado Re ado	scription of Project: The applicant proposes to construct an dition that extends wider than the historic house.commendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the dition with the following conditions:	Attachments A: Site Plan B: Elevations
1.	The concrete block foundation be split faced;	
2.	Staff approve the windows and doors and roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and	
3.	The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side,	
	beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters shall be	
	located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner.	
	Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved	
	prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s).	
Wi and	th these conditions, staff finds the addition meets Sections II.B. I II.B. of the design guidelines.	

Vicinity Map:



Aerial Map:



Applicable Design Guidelines:

II.B.1 New Construction

B. GUIDELINES

a. Height

The height of the foundation wall, porch roof(s), and main roof(s) of a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with those of surrounding historic buildings.

b. Scale

- The size of a new building and its mass in relation to open spaces shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings.
- Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is typically accomplished with a change in material.

c. Setback and Rhythm of Spacing

- The setback from front and side yard property lines established by adjacent historic buildings should be maintained. Generally, a dominant rhythm along a street is established by uniform lot and building width. Infill buildings should maintain that rhythm.
- The Commission has the ability to determine appropriate building setbacks and extend height limitations of the required underlying base zoning for new construction, additions and accessory structures (ordinance no. 17.40.410).

Appropriate setbacks will be determined based on:

- The existing setback of the contributing primary buildings and accessory structures found in the immediate vicinity;
- Setbacks of like structures historically found on the site as determined by historic maps, site plans or photographs;
- Shape of lot;
- · Alley access or lack thereof;
- · Proximity of adjoining structures; and
- · Property lines.

Appropriate height limitations will be based on:

- · Heights of historic buildings in the immediate vicinity
- \cdot Existing or planned slope and grade

In most cases, an infill duplex should be one building, as seen historically in order to maintain the rhythm of the street. Detached infill duplexes may be appropriate in the following instances:

- There is not enough square footage to legally subdivide the lot but there is enough frontage and width to the lot to accommodate two single-family dwellings in a manner that meets the design guidelines;
- The second unit follows the requirements of a Detached Accessory Dwelling Unit; or
- An existing non-historic building sits so far back on the lot that a building may be constructed in front of it in a manner that meets the rhythm of the street and the established setbacks.

d. Materials, Texture, Details, and Material Color

- The materials, texture, details, and material color of a new building's public facades shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings. Vinyl and aluminum siding are not appropriate.
- T-1-11- type building panels, "permastone", E.F.I.S. and other artificial siding materials are generally not appropriate. However, pre-cast stone and cement fiberboard siding are approvable cladding materials for new construction; but pre-cast stone should be of a compatible color and texture to existing historic stone clad structures in the district; and cement fiberboard siding, when used for lapped siding, should be smooth and not stamped or embossed and have a maximum of a 5" reveal. The reveal for lap siding should not exceed 5". Larger reveals may be possible but should not exceed 8" and shall have mittered corners.
- Shingle siding should exhibit a straight-line course pattern and exhibit a maximum exposure of seven inches (7").

Four inch (4") nominal corner boards are required at the face of each exposed corner. Stud wall lumber and embossed wood grain are prohibited.

Belt courses or a change in materials from one story to another are often encouraged for large two-story buildings to break up the massing.

When different materials are used, it is most appropriate to have the change happen at floor lines. Clapboard sided chimneys are generally not appropriate. Masonry or stucco is appropriate. Texture and tooling of mortar on new construction should be similar to historic examples.

Asphalt shingle is an appropriate roof material for most buildings. Generally, roofing should not have strong simulated shadows in the granule colors which results in a rough, pitted appearance; faux shadow lines; strongly variegated colors; colors that are too light (e.g.: tan, white, light green); wavy or deep color/texture used to simulate split shake shingles or slate; excessive flared form in the shingle tabs; uneven or sculpted bottom edges that emphasize tab width or edges, unless matching the original roof.

e. Roof Shape

- The roof(s) of a new building shall be visually compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the roof shape, orientation, and pitch of surrounding historic buildings.
- Roof pitches should be similar to the pitches found in the district. Historic roofs are generally between 6/12 and 12/12.

Roof pitches for porch roofs are typically less steep, approximately in the 3-4/12 range. Generally, two-story residential buildings have hipped roofs.

Generally, dormers should be located on the roof. Wall dormers are not typical in the historic context and accentuate height so they should be used minimally and generally only on secondary facades. When they are appropriate they should be no wider than the typical window openings and should not project beyond the main wall.

f. Orientation

The orientation of a new building's front facade shall be visually consistent with surrounding historic buildings.

Porches

- *New buildings should incorporate at least one front street-related porch that is accessible from the front street.*
- Side porches or porte cocheres may also be appropriate as a secondary entrance, but the primary entrance should address the front.
- Front porches generally should be a minimum of 6' deep, have porch racks that are 1'-3' tall and have posts that include bases and capitals.

Parking areas and Driveways

Generally, curb cuts should not be added.

Where a new driveway is appropriate it should be two concrete strips with a central grassy median. Shared driveways should be a single lane, not just two driveways next to each other. Sometimes this may be accomplished with a single lane curb cut that widens to a double lane deeper into the lot.

Duplexes

- Infill duplexes shall have one or two doors facing the street, as seen on historic duplexes. In the case of corner lots, an entrance facing the side street is possible as long as it is designed to look like a secondary entrance.
- In the case of duplexes, vehicular access for both units should be from the alley, where an alley exists. A new shared curb cut may be added, if no alley and no driveway exists, but the driveway should be no more than 12' wide from the street to the rear of the home. Driveways should use concrete strips where they are typical of the historic context. Front yard parking or driveways which end at the front of the house are not consistent with the character of the historic neighborhoods.

Multi-unit Developments

- For multi-unit developments, interior dwellings should be subordinate to those that front the street. Subordinate generally means the width and height of the buildings are less than the primary building(s) that faces the street.
- For multi-unit developments, direct pedestrian connections should be made between the street and any interior units. The entrances to those pedestrian connections generally should be wider than the typical spacing between buildings along the street.

g. Proportion and Rhythm of Openings

- The relationship of width to height of windows and doors, and the rhythm of solids (walls) to voids (door and window openings) in a new building shall be compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with surrounding historic buildings.
- Window openings on the primary street-related or front façade of new construction should be representative of the window patterns of similarly massed historic structures within the district.
- In most cases, every 8-13 horizontal feet of flat wall surface should have an opening (window or door) of at least 4 square feet. More leniencies can be given to minimally visible side or rear walls.

Double-hung windows should exhibit a height to width ratio of at least 2:1.

- Windows on upper floors should not be taller than windows on the main floor since historically first floors have higher ceilings than upper floors and so windows were typically taller on the first floor.
- Single-light sashes are appropriate for new construction. If using multi-light sashes, muntins should be fully simulated and bonded to the glass, and exhibit an interior bar, exterior bar, as well as a spacer between glass panes.
- Four inch (nominal) casings are required around doors, windows and vents on non-masonry buildings. Trim should be thick enough to extend beyond the clapboard. Double or triple windows should have a 4" to 6" mullion in between.
- Brick molding is required around doors, windows and vents within masonry walls but is not appropriate on non-masonry buildings.
- Generally front doors should be 1/2 to full-light. Faux leaded glass is inappropriate.

i. Utilities

- Utility connections such as gas meters, electric meters, phone, cable, and HVAC condenser units should be located so as to minimize their visibility from the street.
- Generally, utility connections should be placed no closer to the street than the mid point of the structure. Power lines should be placed underground if they are carried from the street and not from the rear or an alley.

j. Public Spaces

- Landscaping, sidewalks, signage, lighting, street furniture and other work undertaken in public spaces by any individual, group or agency shall be presented to the MHZC for review of compatibility with the character of the district.
- Generally, mailboxes should be attached to the front wall of the house or a porch post. In most cases, street-side mailboxes are inappropriate.

2. ADDITIONS

a. Generally, an addition should be situated at the rear of a building in such a way that it will not disturb either front or side facades.

Placement

Additions should be located at the rear of an existing structure.

Connections to additions should, as much as possible, use existing window and door openings rather than remove significant amounts of rear wall material.

Generally, one-story rear additions should inset one foot, for each story, from the side wall. Additions should be physically distinguished from the historic building and generally fit within the shadow line of the existing building.

Additions that tie into the existing roof should be at least 6" off the existing ridge.

In order to assure than an addition has achieved proper scale, the addition should:

- No matter its use, an addition should not be larger than the existing house, not including non-historic additions, in order to achieve compatibility in scale. This will allow for the retention of small and medium size homes in the neighborhood. The diversity of housing type and size is a character defining feature of the historic districts.
- Additions which are essentially a house-behind-a-house with a long narrow connector are not appropriate, as the form does not exist historically. Short or minimal connections that do not require the removal of the entire back wall of a historic building are preferred.
- Additions should generally be shorter and thinner than the existing building. Exceptions may be made when unusual constraints make these parameters unreasonable, such as:
- · An extreme grade change
- Atypical lot parcel shape or size
- In these cases, an addition may rise above <u>or</u> extend wider than the existing building; however, generally the addition should not be taller <u>and</u> extend wider.

When an addition needs to be taller:

Whenever possible, additions should not be taller than the historic building; however, when a taller addition is the only option, additions to single story structures may rise as high as 4' above the shadow line of the existing building at a distance of 40' from the front edge of the existing building. In this instance, the side walls and roof of the addition must set in as is typical for all additions. The portion of the roof that can be seen should have a hipped, side gable or clipped gable roof to help decrease the visual mass of the addition.

When an addition needs to be wider:

Rear additions that are wider than an existing historic building may be appropriate when the building is narrower than 30' or shifted to one side of the lot. In these instances, a structural alcove or channel must separate the existing building from the new addition. The structural alcove should sit in a minimum of 1' and be at least twice as long as it is deep.

In addition, a rear addition that is wider should not wrap the rear corner.

Ridge raises

Ridge raises are most appropriate for one-story, side-gable buildings, (without clipped gables) and that require more finished height in the attic. The purpose of a ridge raise is to allow for conditioned space in the attic and to discourage large rear or side additions. The raised portion must sit in a minimum of 2' from each side wall and can be raised no more than 2' of total vertical height within the same plane as the front roof slope.

Sunrooms

Metal framed sunrooms, as a modern interpretation of early green houses, are appropriate if they are mostly glass or use appropriate cladding material for the district, are located at the rear in a minimally visible location, are minimally attached to the existing structure, and follow all other design guidelines for additions.

Foundation

Foundation walls should set in from the existing foundation at the back edge of the existing structure by one foot for each story or half story. Exception: When an addition is a small one-room deep (12' deep or less) addition that spans the width of the structure, and the existing structure is masonry with the addition to be wood (or appropriate substitute siding). The change in material from masonry to wood allows for a minimum of a four inch (4") inset. Foundation height should match or be lower than the existing structure.

Foundation lines should be visually distinct from the predominant exterior wall material. This is generally accomplished with a change in materials.

Roof

The height of the addition's roof and eaves must be less than or equal to the existing structure. Visually evident roof slopes should match the roof slopes of the existing structure, and roof planes should set in accordingly for rear additions.

Skylights should not be located on the front-facing slope of the roof. Skylights should be flat (no bubble lenses) with a low profile (no more than six inches tall) and only be installed behind the midpoint of the building).

Rear & Side Dormers

- Dormer additions are appropriate for some historic buildings as they are a traditional way of adding ventilation and light to upper stories.
- The addition of a dormer that would require the removal of historic features such as an existing dormer, chimneys, cupolas or decorative feature is not appropriate.

Rear dormers should be inset from the side walls of the building by a minimum of two feet. The top of a rear dormer may attach just below the ridge of the main roof or lower.

- Side dormers should be compatible with the scale and design of the building. Generally, this can be accomplished with the following:
- New dormers should be similar in design and scale to an existing dormer on the building.
- New dormers should be similar in design and scale to an existing dormer on another historic building that is similar in style and massing.
- The number of dormers and their location and size should be appropriate to the style and design of the building. Sometimes dormer locations relate to the openings below. The symmetry or lack of symmetry within a building design should be used as a guide when placing dormers.
- · Dormers should not be added to secondary roof planes.
- \cdot Eave depth on a dormer should not exceed the eave depth on the main roof.
- The roof form of the dormer should match the roof form of the building or be appropriate for the style.
- The roof pitch of the dormer should generally match the roof pitch of the building.
- The ridge of a side dormer should be at least 2' below the ridge of the existing building; the cheeks

should be inset at least 2' from the wall below or adjacent valley; and the front wall of the gable should setback a minimum of 2' from the wall below. (These minimum insets will likely be greater than 2' when following the guidelines for appropriate scale.)

- Dormers should generally be fully glazed and aprons below the window should be minimal.
- The exterior material cladding of side dormers should match the primary or secondary material of the main building.

Side Additions

b. When a lot width exceeds 60 feet or the standard lot width on the block, it may be appropriate to add a side addition to a historic structure. The addition should set back from the face of the historic structure and should be subservient in height, width and massing to the historic structure.

Side additions should be narrower than half of the historic building width and exhibit a height of at least 2' shorter than the historic building.

To deemphasize a side addition, the roofing form should generally be a hip or side-gable roof form. Commercial buildings that desire a covered open-air side additions generally should not enclose the area with plastic sides. Such applications may be appropriate if: the addition is located on the ground

level off a secondary facade, is not located on a street facing side of a building, has a permanent glass wall on the portion of the addition which faces the street, and the front sits back a minimum of three (3') from the front or side wall, depending on placement of the addition.

c. The creation of an addition through enclosure of a front porch is not appropriate. The creation of an addition through the enclosure of a side porch may be appropriate if the addition is constructed in such a way that original form and openings on the porch remain visible and undisturbed.

Side porch additions may be appropriate for corner building lots or lots more than 60' wide.

d. Contemporary designs for additions to existing properties are not discouraged when such additions do not destroy significant historical, architectural, or cultural material; and when such design is compatible, by not contrasting greatly, with the size, scale, color, material, and character of the property, neighborhood, or environment.

e. A new addition should be constructed in such a manner that if the addition were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure would be unimpaired.

Connections should, as much as possible, use existing window and door openings rather than remove significant amounts of rear wall material.

f. Additions should follow the guidelines for new construction.

III.B.1 Demolition is Not Appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such architectural or historical interest and value that its removal would be detrimental to the public interest; or
- b. if a building, or major portion of a building, is of such old or unusual or uncommon design and materials that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced without great difficulty and expense.

III.B.2 Demolition is Appropriate

- a. if a building, or major portion of a building, has irretrievably lost its architectural and historical integrity and significance and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district;
- b. if a building, or major portion of a building, does not contribute to the historical and architectural

character and significance of the district and its removal will result in a more historically appropriate visual effect on the district; or

c. if the denial of the demolition will result in an economic hardship on the applicant as determined by the MHZC in accordance with section 17.40.420 (Historic Zoning Regulations), Metropolitan Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance.

Background: 1051 Petway is a c. 1925 Folk Victorian house (Figure 1). Although it has experienced some alterations over the last century, it is considered to be a contributing house to the Greenwood Neighborhood Conservation Zoning Overlay. The c. 1968 Property Assessor photo shows that at that time, the house was wrapped in non-historic brick (Figure 2). By the 1980s, the front wall of the house had become a cinderblock wall, the historic porch had been removed, and a new porch had been constructed.



Figure 1. 1051 Petway Avenue in 2019.



Figure 2. C. 1968 Property Assessor photo.



Figure 3. 1980s photo of 1051 Petway Ave.

Analysis and Findings: The applicant proposes to construct an addition that extends wider than the historic house.

<u>Demolition</u>: The application includes removing the existing front porch and altering window openings. The front porch that is there currently is not the historic front porch and was added sometime between 1968 and the 1960s. In addition, the window locations on the existing house are not the historic window openings. The front wall is a non-historic cinder block wall, and the front window openings are not original. Making the front openings paired double hung windows is therefore appropriate. The side walls and window openings have also been altered. Staff therefore finds that any changes to the window and door openings on the house meet the design guidelines for appropriate demolition.

Staff finds that the removal of the porch and the alteration of window openings on the front and side facades to meet Section III.B.2. for appropriate demolition.

<u>Height & Scale</u>: The proposed addition is one-and-a-half stories in scale, matching the scale of the historic house. The addition's ridge height is approximately five feet, five inches (5'5") lower than that of the historic house. There is a significant drop in slope on the lot, so the addition's eave and foundation heights are approximately four feet (4') lower in height than the historic house's eave and foundation height.

The addition is inset appropriately from both back corners. On the right side it is inset one foot (1'), which staff finds to be appropriate because this portion of the addition is a one-story porch. The second story is inset approximately seven feet (7') on the right side. On the left side, the addition is two feet (2'), but after a depth of approximately six feet (6') the addition steps back out to be approximately seventeen feet (17') wider than the historic house. Because the lot is over sixty feet (60') wide at sixty-seven feet (67') wide, an addition that extends wider than the house to meet the design guidelines.

The addition will have a depth of fifty feet (50') and a footprint of approximately two thousand, one hundred and thirty-two square feet (2,132 sq. f.t). By comparison, the historic house has a footprint of approximately eighteen hundred square feet (1,800 sq. ft.). Although the footprint of the addition is larger than that of the historic house, staff finds it to be appropriate, in this instance, for several reasons. One, approximately three hundred and seventy-one square feet (371 sq. ft.) of the addition is a rear porch that is one story in height. Two, the addition is at least five feet (5') lower in height than the historic house, and its scale does not overwhelm the historic house. Finally, the lot is unusually large at over sixteen thousand square feet (16,000 sq. ft.). When considering the insets, lower height, and large lot size, staff finds that the footprint is appropriate to the historic house.

The applicant intends to reconstruct the front porch based on the dimensions and appearance in the c. 1968 Property Assessor photo. Staff finds this to meet the design guidelines.

Staff finds that the proposed height and scale of the addition to meets Sections II.B.1.a., II.B.1.b., and II.B.2. of the design guidelines.

<u>Location & Removability</u>: The addition is located behind the historic house with appropriate insets. As mentioned under "Height & Scale," the addition does extend to be wider than the historic house, and the design of the wider portion meets the design guidelines for wider addition. The addition's inset and separate roof forms ensure that it could be removed in the future without altering the historic integrity of the historic house.

Staff finds that the addition's location and removability to meet Sections II.B.2.a and II.B.2.e. of the design guidelines.

<u>Design</u>: The location of the addition at the rear of the existing building is in accordance with the design guidelines. The addition's change in materials, inset, separate roof form, and lower height help to distinguish it from the historic house and read as an addition to the house. At the same time, its scale, materials, roof form, and fenestration pattern are all compatible with the historic character of the existing house. The addition is designed so that if the addition were to be removed in the future, the historic character of the house would still be intact.

Staff finds that the addition's design to meet Sections II.B.2.d and II.B.2.f. of the design guidelines.

<u>Setback & Rhythm of Spacing</u>: The addition meets all base zoning setbacks. It will be at least five feet (5') from the right side property line, thirteen feet (13') from the left side property line, and close to one hundred and twenty feet (120') from the rear property line. The part of the addition that extends wider will not affect the rhythm of spacing of houses along Petway because it is located over forty feet (40') back from the front of the house.

Staff finds that the addition's setback and rhythm of spacing to meet Sections II.B.1.c. and II.B.2. of the design guidelines.

	Proposed	Color/Texture/	Approved	Requires
		Make/Manufact	Previously or	Additional
		urer	Typical of	Review
			Neighborhood	
Foundation	Concrete	Not Indicated	Yes	Yes
	Block			
Cladding	5" cement	Smooth	Yes	No
	fiberboard lap			
	siding			
Roofing	Architectural	Unknown	Yes	Yes
	Shingles			
Trim	Cement	Smooth faced	Yes	No
	Fiberboard			
Front Porch	Wood	Smooth wood	Yes	No
Posts	(pedestals were	(pedestal		
	not indicated)	material needs		
		final approval)		
Side Porch	Wood	Typical	Yes	No
Floor, Steps,				
Post, and				
Railing				
Rear Porch	Wood	Typical	Yes	No
Floor, Steps,				
Post, and				
Railing				
Windows	Not indicated	Needs final	Unknown	Yes
		approval		
Principle	Not indicated	Needs final	Unknown	Yes
Entrance		approval		
Side/rear	Not indicated	Needs final	Unknown	Yes
doors		approval		

Materials:

Staff recommends that the concrete block be split face and that staff approve the windows, doors, and roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation.

With staff's final approval of all final material choices, Staff finds that the known materials meet Sections II.B.1.d. and II.B.2. of the design guidelines.

<u>Roof form</u>: The historic house has a hipped roof with an 10/12 pitch. The addition ties into the historic house's roof with a hipped dormer that is inset at lest 2' from the side walls of the house. The main form of the addition is a side gable with a 10/12 pitch. The new front porch will have a flat roof, mimicking the historic porch roof. The secondary entrance on the wider portion of the addition has a 10/12 gable. The rear addition has additional gabled and shed roof forms that will not be highly visible form the street. Staff finds that these roof forms are compatible with the historic house.

Staff finds that the proposed roof forms meet Sections II.B.1.e. and II.B.2. of the design guidelines.

<u>Orientation</u>: The house is currently a residential duplex and will remain a duplex after the construction of the addition. The entrance to the unit in the addition will be on the wider portion of the addition, behind a porch. Staff finds that the entrance to the rear unit has a secondary appearance that does not compete with the main entrance on the historic house. The entrance's smaller, wood-frame porch and the fact that it sits at a lower grade help it to read as a secondary entrance. Vehicular access to the site will be via the side and/or rear alleys.

Staff finds that the addition's orientation to meet Sections II.B.1.f. and II.B.2. of the design guidelines.

<u>Proportion and Rhythm of Openings</u>: As mentioned under "Partial Demolition," many of the window and door openings will be altered, which is appropriate because the existing windows and doors openings have been altered. In general, many single openings will become paired openings. The fenestration pattern on the historic house and the proposed addition meets the design guidelines. They are all generally twice as tall as they are wide, thereby meeting the historic proportions of openings. There are no large expanses of wall space without a window or door opening.

Staff finds the project's proportion and rhythm of openings to meet Sections II.B.1.g. and II.B.2. of the design guidelines.

<u>Appurtenances & Utilities:</u> No changes to the site's appurtenances were indicated on the drawings. The HVAC shall be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner. Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s).

Recommendation Summary: Staff recommends approval of the addition with the following conditions:

- 1. The concrete block foundation be split faced;
- 2. Staff approve the windows and doors and roof shingle color prior to purchase and installation; and
- 3. The HVAC be located behind the house or on either side, beyond the mid-point of the house, and utility meters shall be located on the side of the building, within 5' of the front corner. Alternative mechanical and utility locations must be approved prior to an administrative sign-off on building permit(s).

With these conditions, staff finds the addition meets Sections II.B. and II.B. of the design guidelines.

Ζ C SZ 0 \mathbf{C} ш 0 Z NO RUCTI CONST FOR NOT





No. Description

Date











A2.0



A1.0



